

In the book's second part, "Nonresistance and a People Apart," the first of its six chapters, "Building the Church" (93–104), continues this historical discussion to describe how the Ostrogers, as well as members of the Kleine Gemeinde, came to be affiliated with the CGCM, which was founded by John Holdeman, a former (Old) Mennonite Church member from Ohio. The remaining five chapters in this section discuss how classic Anabaptist doctrines, including non-resistance and separation from the world, are reflected in the CGCM. The book concludes with two appendices of genealogical interest, "The Kansas Ostrogers" (150–157), "Dutch-Prussian Family Names (158–164), and a third, "Holdeman Congregations in the United States" (165–171).

For readers unfamiliar with Anabaptist migration history, it may be a challenge to form a clear picture of just how the CGCM came to be. John Holdeman, the church's founder, was a descendant of ethnic Swiss Mennonites who settled in Pennsylvania in the early eighteenth century, yet most of his followers ended up being of Flemish and Dutch background. The book would have benefitted from an overview of both major ethnic groups represented among North America's Anabaptist migrants, the colonial-era Swiss–South German Mennonites and Amish and the Flemish–Dutch Mennonites who came to the United States and Canada by way of Russia in the nineteenth century. Also desirable would have been a comparison of Holdeman Mennonites with their more traditional Anabaptist brethren, Old Order Mennonites and Old Colony Mennonites. The book contains occasional references to Amish and Hutterites, but the Old Order and Old Colony Mennonites, who arguably have done just as much as the Holdemans to "preserve the Anabaptism of the sixteenth century," are not discussed.

Mark L. Loudon
University of Wisconsin–Madison

Paola Canova, *Frontier Intimacies: Ayoreo Women and the Sexual Economy of the Paraguayan Chaco*. Austin: University of Texas Press, 2020. Pp. 208. Softcover, \$29.95 US.

At the 2009 Mennonite World Conference in Paraguay, a performance of reconciliation took place when Helmut Isaak delivered a statement of forgiveness to Ayoreo Chief Jonoine, who had killed his brother Kornelius Isaak over fifty years earlier in one of the first

Mennonite missionary contacts with the Ayoreo. Isaak had travelled armed and uninvited 225 kilometres north from the Mennonite colonies of the central Chaco—against even the advice of his own congregation—into Ayoreo territory to stage this ultimately fatal evangelical encounter. The move to reconciliation at the 2009 event elided the ongoing unequal relationships between Mennonites and Ayoreo. The latter had initially been concentrated in mission stations established by the New Tribes Mission and increasingly, over the following fifty years, had settled in improvised neighbourhoods in the Mennonite colonies of the Chaco.

The radical alteration of Ayoreo women's lives that followed from this was also missing in the staged encounter between the two men. This theme lies at the centre of Paola Canova's eloquent *Frontier Intimacies*. The rich ethnography is based on fieldwork in the early 2010s as well ongoing relations with the Ayoreo community stretching across two decades. Her focus is on the Chaco's sexual economy and in particular on *curajodie*, young Ayoreo women who engage in "monetized sexual liaisons with non-Ayoreo men" (3), both Mennonite and non-Mennonite. These practices, the author argues, should be understood in the context of rapid frontier expansion, extractive agriculture, and ranching in the Gran Chaco over the past three decades.

Far to the north of the Gran Chaco, in the oil fields near Fort St. John, British Columbia, and their accompanying transient all-male labour camps, Helen Knott has linked "the growth of the resource industry and the consequent levels of violence experienced by Indigenous women."¹ Canova contributes to this hemispheric acknowledgement of settler colonial expansion as a process that she describes as "gendered violence and oppression of indigenous women" (8). While highly attuned to the vulnerability of her subjects, which is an ever-present theme in *Frontier Intimacies*, Canova's anthropological approach privileges the perspectives of young Ayoreo women and their understandings of their interethnic relationships and sexual liaisons. In doing so, she is careful to neither "romanticize" *curajodie* nor reduce their labour to abstract, commodified, transactional sex. In this respect, her approach resonates with earlier work by anthropologist John Renshaw, who cast the Enlhet practice of delicately balancing precarious labour within pre-existing cultural frameworks as a challenge to the alienating aspects of a capitalist economy. Canova, in the introduction and

¹ Helen Knott, "Violence and Extraction: Stories from the Oil Fields," in *Keetsahnak: Our Missing and Murdered Indigenous Sisters*, ed. Kim Anderson, Maria Campbell, and Christi Belcourt (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2018), 149.

following chapters, also seeks out Ayoreo “pre- and post-colonial moral and economic frameworks.” Despite the impact of colonialism, Ayoreo continue to register their own “ontological values of sexuality” (10).

The first chapter of *Frontier Intimacies* considers the multiple migrations that have produced contemporary Filadelfia. Founded on Enlhet territory as the administrative centre of the Russian Mennonite colony of Fernheim, the city had been defined by unequal Indigenous–Mennonite encounters from its inception in the 1930s. For decades such exchanges largely unfolded in the absence of Paraguayans. This bilateral dynamic was complicated as the city grew at an astounding pace in the early 1990s after the paving of the Transchaco highway. Along this accelerating urban frontier, multiple Indigenous communities, a long-established Mennonite settler community, and new migrants (temporary and permanent) from eastern Paraguay and Brazil now interacted. Setting the context for the chapters that follow, Canova reflects on the Ayoreo position at the bottom of interlocking hierarchies of labour, health, and housing. She also applies a gendered perspective to Mennonite attempts to sustain social differentiation amid rapid change. This was most evident in the rigid, if eroding, “policing of the sexuality of Mennonite women” through “ostracizing, isolation, and excommunication” (47).

The second (and sixth) chapters turn to the growing presence of male ranch workers and long-distance truckers in the Chaco. This resulted in a break from traditional Ayoreo practices of endogamy and *curajodie* increasingly sought out long term relationships and marriage with men from eastern Paraguay. Transient workers, isolated ranches, and endless stretches of road created the conditions for violence with impunity and Canova explores how *curajodie* navigate this ever-present threat as they forge “emotional attachments with men who are normally inaccessible because of pervasive discrimination” (135). The case of Nejamia, a young Ayoreo woman, and Pedro, an eastern Paraguayan ranch worker, is reflective of prevailing trends. Marriage resulted in two children, but Nejamia returned to the practice of *curajodie* as Pedro, in pursuit of short-term “intimacy and domestic help” (69) had hidden the existence of a family in eastern Paraguay.

Chapters 3 and 4 expand on the ways in which *curajodie* challenge the staid social norms of Filadelfia. The city had been the site of Ayoreo movement between missions stations as early as the 1960s. From the outset, this involved widely known but silenced sexual relationships between Ayoreo women and Mennonite men. A half-century later, Ayoreo women are doubly marginalized in the

city as they are subject to precarious housing and limited employment opportunities. Yet, as Canova argues, they reject the limited and submissive roles assigned to them within a hierarchical frontier economy. Firstly, in their relationships with Ayoreo men, women regularly appropriated the wages of their partners for distribution in broader kinship networks, negotiated their salaries, and made decisions about terminating their employment with Mennonite and non-Mennonite employers. Secondly, through their intimate relationships with non-Ayoreo men, *curajodie* flaunted social norms as they pursued men, drank, socialized, and engaged in conspicuous consumption in public space.

These sexual practices reflect the exigencies of a neo-colonial order but, as Canova suggests, they are also rooted in Ayoreo resistance to the gendered impact of missionization. Missionaries deliberately limited Ayoreo women's traditional authority through the imposition of a patriarchal gendered order. Yet Ayoreo retain a pre-colonial attachment to the sexual autonomy of the individual, evident in contemporary *curajodie* that is markedly different from the policing of female sexuality in Mennonite, Paraguayan, and mission contexts. Ayoreo thus incorporate "some Christian moral registers" (115) without allowing notions of shame to permeate sexual exchange.

In chapter 5, "Consuming Desire," Canova turns to the sexual economy connecting Ayoreo women and Mennonite men. In contrast to their pursuit of longer-term emotional connections with Paraguayans, *curajodie* engage in something closer to transactional sex with Mennonites while still resisting language that frames these exchanges as entirely commoditized. Sexual relations between Ayoreo women and Mennonite men are widespread in Filadelfia, though scorn for these activities falls disproportionately on *curajodie*. Some Mennonite men hide these liaisons while sustaining an external image of respectability. Others openly flaunt community norms. In some situations, Mennonite employers have exploited power relationships over the family members of *curajodie* to "evade responsibility for their actions" (121) when unwanted pregnancies result.

For its unflinching assessment of the sexual economy of Paraguay's largest Mennonite colony and for its nuanced approach to Ayoreo women's perspectives on their participation in that economy, Paola Canova's *Frontier Intimacies* is a remarkable work. No other researchers have conducted fieldwork of this nature in the Chaco. The book should be required reading for those interested in Indigenous-Mennonite encounters in general and Mennonite history in Latin America in particular. Though the book deals primarily with sexual relationships between Paraguayans and Ayoreo, these

occur within an ambit decisively shaped by the presence of Mennonites in the central Chaco over the last century.

Beyond its importance for Mennonite studies, Canova also makes a welcome addition to a growing Indigenous-centred scholarship on the region. Anthropologist Gastón Gordillo has explored the Toba in the Argentine Chaco, and in particular revealed the historical and contemporary spatial practices of that Indigenous community as it moved between extractive economies, mission stations, and riverine ecosystems. Hannes Kalisch has published several collections of Enlhet oral histories that illustrate the devastating effects of the Chaco War, yellow fever brought by soldiers and settlers, and the spatial occupation of Enlhet lands by Mennonites. For Bolivia, Nancy Postero and Erick Langer have engaged in similarly nuanced explorations of historical and contemporary Guaraní experiences of missionization and urbanization. Yet Ayoreo life, in Bolivia and Paraguay, remains largely unexplored. That Canova's book is grounded in personal testimonies from Ayoreo women whose voices are too often missing from even critical explorations of internal and settler colonialism in the Gran Chaco makes this long overdue work all the more important.

Ben Nobbs-Thiessen
University of Winnipeg

Elena Osokina, *Stalin's Quest for Gold: The Torgsin Hard-Currency Shops and Soviet Industrialization*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2021. Pp. 348. Hardcover, \$45.95 US.

The hard-currency stores known as Torgsin that developed in the Soviet Union are well known among Mennonite historians who study the 1930s. These stores performed a crucial role in saving Mennonites and other Soviet citizens during the famine as relatives and others from abroad sent money which could be exchanged for food. Although these stores were essential during the famine, less is known about how they began or functioned during their brief six years of operation. Elena Osokina's fascinating book provides a complete history of the Torgsin, detailing the many compromises that the Soviet regime proved willing to make to access hard currency and gold in their quest for industrialization. As the state pushed forward with no regard for the human cost, the Torgsin, contradictorily, became