Several years ago, there was an article in The Mennonite Reporter describing a conference in Ontario. A young woman was reported to have been overwhelmed by the experience of singing hymns in four-part harmony in the midst of a large group of Mennonites. She said ecstatically, "The middle name of Mennonites is music!" Her enthusiasm may have been somewhat naive but there is no doubt that music has been an important part of Mennonite congregational life. Building on a solid foundation of congregational singing and music-making, Mennonites are also moving onto the concert stages of the country and the world in increasing numbers. It is therefore both interesting and important that we try to understand the ways in which music among the Mennonites has been cultivated and nourished.

The period from 1945 to 1960 witnessed many significant developments in Mennonite music-making. The following discussion is divided into four sections: instrumental music, hymnody, choral and congregational singing, and a final section that tries to grapple with the implications of a growing musical gap that had its origins in the 1950s and is now a cause for concern in many congregations.

Instrumental Music

As with the development of choral singing among the Mennonites of Canada in the 1920s and 1930s, there were several men who felt that the playing of instruments was important both for itself and in support of choral and congregational singing. They pursued their vision in spite of opposition and misunderstanding and established the conditions necessary for the more
organized activities that occurred after 1940. I will discuss only orchestral music as it was practiced in one Southern Manitoba town but there are other activities that need investigation. For example, many towns also had bands that played an important part in the ceremonial and recreational life of their inhabitants.

Perhaps the most prominent of the early instrumentalists was John Konrad. Born in Tiegenhagen in 1898, he and his wife came to Canada in 1926 and settled in Winkler. Here he established a music studio where he taught violin to as many as 100 students. In 1931 he moved to Winnipeg and in 1937 began to work at the Bornoff Conservatory, a music school he eventually bought in 1949. Even after he had moved to Winnipeg he continued to travel to towns in Southern Manitoba to give music lessons and encouraged the formation of orchestras, especially to accompany large choral works.

Ben Horch was another person intensely interested in encouraging instrumental music. The North End Mennonite Brethren church he belonged to in Winnipeg had a tradition of amateur orchestral playing established and encouraged by two of its ministers, Erdman Nikkel (1921–25) and C. N. Hiebert (1925–41). The church became the base for the Wayside Chapel Orchestra conducted by Horch after 1932. The orchestra was viewed with some suspicion by Mennonite Brethren who remembered that the "Froehliche Richtung" had used musical instruments to accompany their heretical enthusiasm, but in 1935 Franz C. Thiessen asked the orchestra to accompany his "Liebhaber" choir's performance of Mendelssohn's St. Paul and the suspicions gradually subsided. Here was one source of players for the Mennonite Symphony Orchestra that Horch would organize in the 1940s.

When Horch returned from his studies in California in 1943, he was hired by the Winkler School Board to teach music. Here he organized the Winkler Collegiate Symphony Orchestra. The first concert occurred in March, 1944, beginning a decade and a half of regular concerts in Winkler, Winnipeg, and elsewhere in Manitoba. Horch continued to conduct the orchestra in Winkler even though he moved to Winnipeg in 1945. In June 1947 the orchestra played Schubert's Unfinished Symphony in Winkler, Morden, Altona, Steinbach, and Winnipeg. The soloist was young Reynold Siemens, a Grade 10 student who would later go on to study at the Curtis Institute in Philadelphia, carrying on a distinguished career as a cellist before abandoning music for literature.

In March 1948 the orchestra travelled to Winnipeg to play for a performance of Messiah at the Mennonite Brethren Bible College. In 1950 the Collegiate Orchestra travelled to Winnipeg once more to join forces with a group of instrumentalists in Winnipeg. Consisting of Emmanuel Horch's violin students and woodwind and brass players trained by his brother Ben, the Winnipeg musicians combined with the Winkler group to form the Mennonite Symphony Orchestra in a concert at the Playhouse Theatre. An ambitious program included the Schumann Piano Concerto, the Unfinished Symphony, and Reynold Siemens was once more the cello soloist. Although
concerts of orchestral music were occasionally given, Horch conceived of the orchestra primarily as a group to accompany large choral works. Initially, of course, this meant Handel's Messiah.\(^8\)

Students in the Winkler orchestra were transported to Winnipeg each week for lessons in car pools organized by their parents and the school principal. These were heady, exhilarating days, according to Reynold Siemens, when everything seemed possible.\(^9\) J. P. Redekopp took over the leadership of the orchestra in 1951 and continued to train young Winkler musicians throughout the decade.\(^10\)

There are also reports of smaller orchestras in nearby villages like Hornedein and Rosenfeld. Farmers like my grandfather, Peter D. Berg, also a minister in the Rudnerweider Church, took the train into Winnipeg once a week for a while to take violin lessons. And "Fiddla" Doft, another violinist from a neighbouring farm, got his nickname for his expressive violin playing. There are reports of villagers getting together to play string quartets; K. H. Neufeld played the cello and is known to have participated in such events. Winkler boasted a string quartet that became known beyond the boundaries of the town. Consisting of Lloyd Siemens, Reynold's brother, Elsa Redekopp, Walter Dyck, and Peter Enns, the quartet played frequent concerts in the 1950s and also made short tours to neighbouring states in the U.S.\(^11\)

One last person should be mentioned in connection with the fostering of instrumental music in Manitoba. K. H. Neufeld was the dominant figure in choral music but he was also convinced that choruses were incomplete without an orchestra. Whenever possible he had an orchestra accompany the performances he was conducting, even if he had to hire the Siemens brothers to come with him on the train to provide the nucleus for an instrumental group. In this way he provided encouragement, valuable experience, and financial incentives for young instrumentalists to continue to practise their instruments.

Similar stories could be found in other areas as well. Walter Neufeld established a large string studio in the Fraser Valley whose graduates frequently accompanied the choirs trained by his brother, Menno Neufeld. The accomplishments of Jay Armin, born in the Ukraine, and his children, Otto, born in Winnipeg, Richard and Paul, both born in Winkler, and Adele, born in Morris, Manitoba, are well known.\(^12\) No doubt the Niagara Peninsula and the Kitchener Waterloo areas had their share of violinists, pianists and cellists as well. This is certainly an area in which more research needs to be done.

Hymnody

Only the Old Order Amish and the Hutterian Brethren among the various Mennonite groups sing hymns unique to their traditions. Most Mennonites sing hymns borrowed from other denominations. The study of Mennonite
hymnody is therefore not primarily the history of an indigenous tradition but
the story of anthologies of hymns assembled to meet the needs of different
groups of people at different times in their history.

The struggle to preserve the German language continued to have impor-
tant implications for the hymnody of Mennonites of Russian origin between
1940 and 1960. It was during these two decades that the transition from
German to English hymnals began to take place. I shall comment very briefly
on the hymnody of two groups.

Conference of Mennonites in Canada

After a difficult and occasionally stormy gestation period the Conference
of Mennonites in Canada produced the hymnal, Gesangbuch der Men-
noniten, in 1942. J. P. Claszen, Winnipeg hymnologist, struggled mightily in
the late 1930s to produce a hymnal that would come close to meeting contem-
porary European standards, but the hymnal fell far short of his expecta-
tions. For example, it perpetuated the outmoded practice of assigning the
same familiar melody to as many as a half-dozen texts. Its main shortcom-
ing, however, was the abundance of translations of gospel hymns and other
English hymns that Claszen saw as inferior to the noble chorales of the
German tradition.

Very few Mennonites shared Claszen's fastidiousness with regard to
gospel hymns, however. In many churches the Gesangbuch shared a place in
the pews with the Evangeliums–Lieder, the German translation of the
Moody–Sankey Gospel Hymns. These are the revival hymns whose literary
and musical qualities most hymnologists view with considerable misgiving. In
spite of Claszen's many letters to Der Bote condemning the new hymnal, it
was reprinted in 1944, 1947, and 1949, and sold a total of 20,000 copies. It
remained the main source of German hymns for CMC congregations until a
new Gesangbuch appeared in 1965. Those few congregations who needed an
English hymnal were able to use The Mennonite Hymnary, produced for the
General Conference in 1940. This excellent book was not replaced until 1969.

Canadian Mennonite Brethren Conference

If the CMC churches used the Evangeliums–Lieder to supplement the
Gesangbuch, in Mennonite Brethren churches it was the main German hym-
nal throughout the 1940s. In 1952 the Canadian MB Conference published a
German hymnal that did provide a more balanced diet, but the main focus
was still on the so-called "Kernlieder." These tended to be gospel hymns or
the spiritual songs arising from the Pietist movement in Germany. Thirty
percent of its contents were from the Evangeliums–Lieder. Shortly after its
publication the trend towards English became more pronounced and the
German hymnal was translated into English. This hymnal appeared in 1960
and served the Canadian MB Conference for the next decade, but many of
the translations were not very successful and the need for a new hymnal soon became apparent.

The two hymnals — CMC and MB — are similar in content and purpose. Both look back. The CMC Gesangbuch was assembled by men whose main concern was to provide hymns that were familiar to their congregations. Many of the hymns were drawn from the Gesangbuch ohne Noten, brought from Russia, and the Gesangbuch mit Noten, the German hymnal of the North American Mennonites. Both hymnals were old and out of date. The MB hymnal set out deliberately to preserve and perpetuate the musical heritage the Brethren had brought with them from Russia. In many cases the committee transcribed the tunes as sung by the congregation for use in the hymnal, rather than attempting to restore the tune to its original form. Neither committee used the hymnological and musicological standards that J. P. Claszen, for example, felt were being used in other denominations. Nor were the congregations ready for hymnals that followed more abstract standards of musical and literary quality.

In both conferences it took almost two decades before the congregations were ready to accept hymnals emphasizing such standards: the CMC with a German hymnal in 1965 followed by a joint General Conference–Mennonite Church English hymnal in 1969, and the MBs with a common North American hymnal in 1971. And in both conferences it was undoubtedly the increasing sophistication of both music leaders and congregations, more of whom were being given opportunities in the 1950s for advanced education in music, theology, and literature, that made acceptance of these new hymnals possible.

Choirs and Congregational Singing

One of the most significant developments in the way Mennonites approached music in their congregations occurred towards the end of World War II. Cultural activities usually suffer during wartime, partly because the wealth and leisure time needed for the arts is directed toward supplying the war machine, and partly because of the dislocation of members of congregations and their choirs, orchestras, and other musical groups. Such dislocations certainly affected Mennonite congregations. Married and older folks had to be invited to rejoin the choir, and mixed choirs were converted to ladies choirs in response to tenor and bass sections decimated by conscription. At the same time, however, provincial and national leaders embarked on ambitious programs to improve choral and congregational music in their congregations and conferences.

Encouraged by their national conferences, MB and CMC provincial conferences from Ontario to British Columbia began to support the study of music and the training of musical leaders in a systematic way. Such activities had been carried on during the 1920s and 1930s, but had depended on the individual initiative and efforts of energetic and far-sighted persons like K.
H. Neufeld, Aron Sawatzky, Franz Thiessen, and David Paetkau. Perhaps partly because these men had established the necessary foundations, and partly because, paradoxically, the war had ended the struggles of the Depression and finally brought the beginnings of prosperity to these immigrant people, the time was now ripe for musical education and stimulation on a broad front.

Beginning in 1944 conductors were hired to travel about the provinces, working with conductors of church choirs and conducting large mass choirs in which the young people of a congregation or group of congregations could participate. Thus the standards of musical leadership in the churches were improved while young congregational members became better singers and musicians by osmosis, creating a demand for further improvements.

The growth of choral activities and the education of musical leaders at short workshops and courses continued into the mid-1950s. The level of musical sophistication that the participants brought to the courses was fairly rudimentary. Mennonite school children no longer learned to sing with Ziffern in the 1950s; that issue had been laid to rest in the 1930s. It is quite likely, however, that many of the participants in the workshops had learned to sing by the old method. I am old enough to give a first hand report on how students in a rural one-room Mennonite school in Manitoba learned music in the late '50s. Once or twice a week we would gather around the radio with a little red book of folk songs, tune in the CBC Manitoba School Broadcast, and learn how to sing using the sol fa system. There were very few opportunities for music lessons, so one's musical education did not progress much beyond getting a reasonably good idea of how to sing a melody.

This was clearly not enough to be able to lead a choir or make informed judgements about the use of music in the worship service. Hence the need for music instruction and the development of the system of workshops. As the opportunities for education and travel grew in the 1950s, however, the system of music education that had evolved became inadequate.

An indication of what was to come occurred in 1945 when Ben Horch declined an offer to conduct provincial workshops for the Canadian Mennonite Brethren Conference because he had been appointed to organize a music department at the new Mennonite Brethren Bible College (MBBC) in Winnipeg. Within twelve years the focus for music education among Mennonite Brethren lay music leaders had shifted to the College. MBBC organized the first All Canadian Conductors Conference in 1957, with musicians assembling in Winnipeg from all over Canada. The first conferences were mainly for Mennonite Brethren lay music leaders but since 1975 a series of conferences has been held in which both Winnipeg colleges participate.

Horch was also the first Canadian Mennonite conductor and teacher to get a professional education in music. Most of the others had been self taught, or at least had little formal education beyond what they encountered in the week-long workshops they themselves had attended in their youth. Horch studied at Biola College in California and then in Detmold, West
Germany, and brought academic respectability and high musical standards to the college music program. By 1962 George Wiebe had completed a Masters degree in Church Music at the University of Southern California. The pattern for the future had been established. The tradition of church or conference-sponsored workshops as a means of imparting musical knowledge for service in the church had served Mennonites well since the end of the nineteenth century in Russia. They enjoyed a brief efflorescence in the 1940s, but their time had passed. From now on the Bible colleges and eventually the universities took over the task of preparing musicians for the church.

**Musical Sophistication**

If one pattern emerges from the study of the 1950s, it is a pattern of change and new beginnings. It was a time when Canadian Mennonites began to move into the cities in large numbers and to attend colleges and universities. It was a time of cultural changes associated with the substitution of English for German. All of these changes had a profound impact on the way Mennonites in Canada made and thought about music. I have tried to show above that a line of musical development that began in Russia came to an end in the 1950s. The same decade saw the beginning of a new line of development, a line whose fruits we have begun to see in their fullness only in the last decade.

The debates of the 1940s and 1950s over the quality of various kinds of hymns and their suitability for inclusion in a Mennonite hymnal have already been touched upon. I have suggested that greater opportunities for advanced education in music, theology, and literature resulted in hymnals organized according to literary and musical standards quite different from those used in the older ones. It might seem at first glance that this would be a trend that would continue to gather momentum but events of the last year have demonstrated that this is not the case. In the first four months of 1988 the readers of the *Mennonite Brethren Herald* have witnessed a passionate debate on the relative merits of hymns and choruses similar to the one that raged over gospel hymns a generation ago. In some Mennonite churches only hymns are sung; in others the chorus reigns. In some churches hymns and choruses expressing a simple evangelical faith are deliberately emphasized; in others there has been a trend to more and more rarefied standards of music and performance.

There are therefore two broad trajectories present in Mennonite music. One is anchored in the tradition of evangelical piety first brought into Mennonite music by the Mennonite Brethren in 1860 with their adoption of the Moody–Sankey gospel hymns and the spiritual folk songs of the German Pietist movement. Other groups took over this hymnody at different times as fundamentalist or other forms of evangelical theology were adopted by Mennonite congregations. The central core of gospel hymns has since been surrounded by scripture choruses and a new corpus of compositions using the
idiom of popular music. The other trajectory has taken Mennonite musicians into the world of high art. Professional training at the highest level that first began to take place in the 1950s has produced musicians and audiences who feel comfortable with the great masterpieces of music. It is the questions raised by this latter trajectory that provide the focus for the last part of this essay.

The musical development of the second trajectory is a progression from easy to difficult, from simple to complex — a difference in quality as well as kind. This is not the lateral substitution of North American evangelical theology for Russian Mennonite piety, for example. It requires study, constant practise, and time to mature and grow. It occurs when church music leaders have two or three years of college training rather than two or three weeks of casual workshop experience. It occurs when college choirs visit rural churches and sing unfamiliar, challenging music. It occurs when a radio station like CFAM, Altona, Manitoba, broadcasts several hours of classical music every day, as it did when it was started in 1957 with Ben Horch as music director. It might be relevant to report that it was a program of piano music I heard on CFAM in the summer of 1959 that provided the inspiration for me to become a musician; there are others for whom such broadcasts were also a revelation.

Whatever the events or names one sees as particularly significant, there seems little doubt that Mennonites have established themselves as important musical artists in Canada. For some it is the Deutsches Requiem by Brahms in Winnipeg in January 1985, for some the Britten War Requiem in Waterloo in 1986, for some the Beethoven Missa solemnis in Winnipeg in November 1987, and there are many looking forward to major choral concerts with Helmuth Rilling and Robert Shaw in 1989. Mennonite musicians are now able to perform the great masterpieces of music with skill and sensitivity, and names like Tracy Dahl, Arthur Janzen, Ingrid Suderman, Henrietta Schellenberg, Daniel Lichti, Fred Stolzfuss, Ben Heppner, William Thiessen, Victor Braun, Theodore Baerg, Paul Frey, William Reimer, and Edith Wiens, suggest that we have moved onto the Canadian and world stages as individuals as well.

These achievements can be a source of satisfaction and pride. But not too much pride, please! Let us not forget that as late as the 1950s Mennonite choirs were still singing the music of composers whose names the writers of history books usually neglect to mention. Beethoven and Bach were incomprehensible and suspect, although Mendelssohn and, of course, Handel, were becoming acceptable. Ben Horch testifies to a certain amount of uneasiness and suspicion that was only gradually overcome when the tradition of performing Handel’s Messiah was first begun by his college choir in the 1940s. The music of our own century has only been explored seriously in the last decade or so. For a long time many Mennonites were satisfied with music that was often mediocre and robust but not always very cultivated
performances. The middle name of Mennonites may be music but it was not always very good music!

Nevertheless, the accomplishments of the last decade are real enough. They are developments that grow out of the urbanization, education and language changes of the 1950s. In the 1920s Franz Thiessen tried singlehandedly to persuade his people that classical music was appropriate for Mennonite Christians to listen to and perform. In the late 1930s, Ben Horch began a similar crusade, trying with the experiences he gave his singers to provide an answer to the question, "Kann die Kunst auch zur Ehre des Herrn dienen?" (Can the arts also serve to glorify the Lord?) In the late 1940s it ceased to be a one-man crusade. There was acceptance followed by enthusiasm. Having become accustomed to good music an appetite for more good music was developed. But how well does the model of change suggested by our theme — from piety to sophistication — fit in the case of music?

There are no doubt other words — accommodation, adaptation, urbanization, or perhaps professionalism — that can be used to describe the same phenomenon. The accommodation and adaptation that usually accompany urbanization have obvious implications for the spiritual life of individuals and groups moving to the city. One might argue that as the musician moves from the sanctuary to the concert hall the sacred is diluted, or perhaps even overwhelmed, by the secular. As the musician pays attention to music for its own sake, rather than seeing music primarily as a vehicle for the transmission of a sacred text, dogma gives way to dialectic. These tendencies cannot be denied but I believe that it is also possible to identify signs of spiritual growth in this process. Let me try to explain why.

Although Nicholas Wolterstorff warns those participating in the institutions of high art against the potential for idolatry and corruption, he goes on to say, "From the resources of this institution has come forth a flood of great works which together have enriched and deepened our lives immeasurably. Without the presence of this institution, our existence would be drastically impoverished." Wolterstorff suggests that the passionate commitment of high art to the purely aesthetic contemplation of works of art may lead to a separation of art from life, producing a highly secular climate in which artistic merit is measured only by how well the artist has contributed to the advance of the art, but he also points out the many ways in which the arts "are a facet in the attainment of our human destiny." Great works of art can be sources of profound insights into the human condition. They can confirm, provide concreteness, illuminate, challenge, and console. They provide occasions to experience exaltation both as performers and as listeners; in short, the arts are an essential part of any healthy spiritual life.

If this is so, then it is possible to argue that great music, for example, presents us with an aspect of the spiritual world that less inspired music cannot. Bach's St. Matthew Passion offers us insights whose profundity Stainer's Crucifixion cannot match. Does it follow from this that Mennonites who now perform and appreciate the Matthew Passion have experienced
significant spiritual growth since the 1940s and '50s, when music by Stainer, Witty, and Forman was the standard fare for Mennonite choral societies and congregational choirs? Or do people of God only sing Stainer? Do we cease being the people of God when we can no longer tolerate a steady diet of gospel hymns? Advanced education, professionalism, and secularization seem to go hand in hand in what is still sometimes seen as a sinister, subversive partnership. But in music, at least, this partnership has made some of the most sublime and profound of all human creations accessible to a large number of Mennonites.

This is not to deny or ignore the tensions and paradoxes created by these trends. Churches that had large choirs in the early 1950s saw them dwindle in size as the end of the decade drew near. The festivals of the 1940s were events drawing in hundreds of people in every region; the oratorio performances of today are elite events in large centres for well-trained singers and professional instrumentalists, the latter rarely Mennonites. And not all congregations wish to sing or listen to Bach. Congregations singing well-known gospel hymns sang heartily; congregations now stumble occasionally when confronted with a new hymn in a contemporary style or a familiar hymn altered to make it acceptable to the musicologist. The performances that once took place in a church now take place in a concert hall. Is it possible to worship in a concert hall? If it is, is the quality or depth of worship different? Is this what is meant by the secularization of the sacred?

These are questions that probably would have been meaningless in 1955 but they grow directly out of the events of that era. In particular, we need to try to understand the growing gap between the two musical trajectories. Does the high art trajectory represent a phenomenon based on the mass choral movement of the 1940s and 1950s, incapable of being sustained into the next generation? Can the two trajectories be reconciled? Which represents the more authentic musical expression of the Mennonite soul? I am sure that as we seek answers to the questions that crowd around our theme, we will learn much about the place of the arts in our lives and the lives of our congregations.

Notes


3 Ibid., 18.

4 Winkler Progress (27 October 1954).

5 The Altona Echo (29 March 1944).

6 The Altona Echo (4 June 1947).

7 The Altona Echo (31 March 1948).

8 Conversation with Ben Horch, 30 May 1988.

10 The Altona Echo (23 May 1956).
11 The Canadian Mennonite (28 May 1954); and The Altona Echo (25 November 1953) contain reports on the activities of the Winkler String Quartet.
16 Mennonite Encyclopedia, 11, 883.
18 Ibid.
21 See Berg, “Gesangbuch, Ziffern, and Deutschum,” 14–15, for an account of the debate between Aron Sawatzky and J. P. Claszen on the merits of Ziffern.
22 In the music heard on the programs of television evangelists, for example, the musical idiom is that of the cocktail lounge, the sentimental love song of the 1940s and 1950s.
25 Ibid., 193.
26 Ibid., 145–151, 193.