

Religious Reversion in the Brethren in Christ Church in Zimbabwe

Daryl Climenhaga, *Providence Theological Seminary*, and Bekitemba Dube, *Brethren in Christ Church, Zimbabwe*

Introduction

This essay asks why some converts to the Christian faith within the Brethren in Christ (BIC) Church in Zimbabwe revert from the Christian faith.¹ We seek to answer the question of reversion from Christian faith through the following process. In part one Climenhaga sets the stage by looking at the BIC Church in the context of Zimbabwe. In part two he suggests some reasons that converts might revert. In part three Dube tells the stories of fourteen people (in thirteen stories) who have reverted from the BIC Church in Zimbabwe. In the conclusion we consider the meaning of our stories and seek a deeper understanding of the larger patterns of conversion and reversion. A brief note from a long-term missionary in Zimbabwe, Jake Shenk, is included, but

Dube's interviews take priority over both the theoretical section and Shenk's observations.

An Introduction to the Brethren in Christ in Zimbabwe

The Brethren in Christ Church in Zimbabwe has its roots in the modern missionary movement, as a small party of Americans from the BIC Church in North America travelled to Zimbabwe in December 1898.² The first party of missionaries included four people: Jesse and Elizabeth Engle, Frances Davidson, and Alice Heise. Since the White Settlers only came into Zimbabwe in larger numbers in 1892, following the Rudd Concession,³ one can see that the BIC Church has its roots close to the beginning of the modern state of Zimbabwe.⁴

The missionaries received permission to go into the Matopo Hills,⁵ which meant that they settled first close to the centre of the recently concluded Ndebele effort to oust the white settlers.⁶ What they felt like in going to this area may be inferred from a news note in the American BIC church paper, the *Evangelical Visitor (EV)*: "Recent uprisings among the natives of Africa in consequence of English taxation have culminated in the massacre of Missionaries among which were at least five, of the United Brethren order; also about \$50,000 worth of church property was destroyed."⁷ Note the North American tendency to see Africa as a homogenous whole (the place is simply given as "Africa", although the events probably took place in West Africa),⁸ as well the assumption that Africa was dangerous and savage.

The missionaries themselves showed a rather greater awareness of African realities, growing out of their call to the missionary task and their experience in southern Africa. Jesse Engle wrote to the home church at length in the *EV* to show how open were the hearts of the indigenous people of Africa to the gospel.⁹ Writing from Bulawayo just before the missionary party moved out to Matopo (about 30 miles south of the settlement of Bulawayo), he observed several preconceptions: "While intellectually the African may stand inferior to some of the heathen nations, to their credit be it said that many, had they had our own advantages in civil and religious culture, would not be a whit behind many of our own race."¹⁰ Significantly his words contained a mixture of the presumed superiority of the white settlers combined with a belief that all people share a fundamental equality as human beings.

Engle exhibited the missionaries' awareness of complex political tensions in the area in a report to the home church: "Then too, the

hut tax is no doubt chaffing to some, which may have the tendency to make them feel somewhat unpleasant, and while some of our company are somewhat fearful, yet others are not at all so inclined.”¹¹ Based on a set amount for each hut in the village, this tax was imposed by the colonial authorities in order to force the indigenous population to begin the process of integrating into the colonial political reality.¹² Combined with rents paid to the settlers who had usurped their land, the tax created a deep grievance.¹³

The missionaries entered the heart of Ndebele territory just after the second uprising against the white settlers taking over their homeland. Dube, Dube, and Nkala describe the politically tense entrance of the missionaries thus:

Because of the war, the AmaNdebele mistrusted the white man. At a national level, there was never integration between the black people and the whites. The whites ended up occupying the better lands, mainly on the plateau. Even the lands in the Matopo Hills were affected by the forced relocation of the AmaNdebele from their lands. This situation of racial tension would affect the life of the BIC church in Zimbabwe for many decades after the arrival of the missionaries.¹⁴

Jesse Engle refers to the missionaries’ efforts to distinguish themselves from the settlers on various occasions. For example, he writes to the church in North America thus:

We now ordered a halt as we entered the valley, out-spanned (the common African term) and had a warm breakfast. Before this was over we were again surrounded by natives who came to meet “the strangers,” the Grand Induna being among them. Before leaving, the Induna told those around us that these people were not like other white people, but are come to teach and do them good, and that what they would tell them they should do; after which they bid us their salekahle (farewell) and left.¹⁵

Whether or not the missionaries were perceived by the Ndebele as truly different from the white settlers is another question, as the people watching were to judge more by what the foreigners did than by what they said at the beginning. Frances Davidson later recalled the location of the mission in these words:

When we were at Cape Town enroute for Rhodesia, Brother Engle had an interview with the late Mr. Rhodes in regard to a grant of land for the Mission. Mr. Rhodes at once agreed, and by letter recommended the Government here to grant us three thousand acres, preferably in the Matoppos, as that had been the hot bed of the rebellion and was still

more or less unsubdued. He added, "Missionaries are better than policemen and cheaper."¹⁶

Clearly Rhodes sought to use the missionaries for his own purposes, even as the missionaries pursued their own intention to preach the gospel. A similar pattern in which each party acted in pursuit of their own goals applies in general to the white settlers, the indigenous people, and the missionaries.

The growth of the mission church was steady rather than unusually rapid. Following the founding of Matopo Mission in 1898, Mtshabezi Mission began in 1906 and Wanezi Mission in 1924.¹⁷ These three each developed a farm and educational facilities. There were clinics as well, resulting eventually in the building of a hospital at Mtshabezi in 1951.¹⁸ The three original mission stations were supplemented by a fourth in the West Gwaii District at Phumula, where a hospital was built in 1964.¹⁹

One result of this combination of evangelism with education and medical care was that converts not only became Christians, but also adopted a Western lifestyle modelled on that of the white settlers. The missionaries themselves increasingly moved in the direction of white settler culture, although their theology of separation from the world made them suspicious of too close an alliance.

Nancy Heisey has analysed the language used by the first founding generation of missionaries and compared it to the second institutionalising generation.²⁰ She observes that the founding generation described their African co-workers with a generous estimation of their character. Engle's description above of the people his group encountered is an example of this development. Frances Davidson is notable in this respect,²¹ especially as she worked with Ndhlalambi Moyo, one of the first converts in the Zimbabwean church and a co-worker with Frances Davidson and Adda Engle as they pressed north across the Zambezi River to plant the BIC in Zambia.²² Moyo was referred to as a helper, but was clearly one of the founders of the BIC in Zambia. He later took the first name of David, in Frances Davidson's honour.

The institutionalising generation, in contrast, increasingly adopted the categories of the colonial structures within which they found themselves. One result of this adaptation was the close identification of Christian faith with Western culture. The first missionaries made a similar identification, but between Christian faith and their own subculture of North American society.²³ In spite of efforts to hold on to BIC Church distinctives, such as the plain dress and avoidance of worldly amusements, colonial Rhodesia became the context that defined Christian faith.

A basic change in the orientation of the church took place in the 1960s and 1970s. In 1964 the parent church in North America formally handed over the governance of the BIC Church in Zimbabwe and Zambia to the members of the church.²⁴ Although the BIC in Zimbabwe now had formal autonomy, missionary influence remained strong. As nationalistic aspirations within the country led to increasing challenges to the colonial structures, the Settler government separated from the United Kingdom in a declaration of independence from England in 1964. The 15 years that followed saw the rise of a military struggle for majority rule led by ZAPU and ZANU.²⁵ As the struggle intensified, most missionary personnel were withdrawn in 1977,²⁶ and the last group were withdrawn in 1979.²⁷ By the coming of political independence the BIC had established full and effective local control over church structures. Missionaries from North America eventually returned to Zimbabwe, but in a new relationship.

This narrative sets the stage for a consideration of conversion and reversion: What happens when people convert to Christian faith and then leave the Christian faith? One observes that this question may receive different answers, depending on who is speaking.²⁸ From a missiological perspective, at least two possibilities suggest themselves: missiological – that conversion had not embraced a particular worldview; and socio-political – that Christianity was identified with the Settlers, so that reverting to traditional religion was a political act. We begin with the missiological.

Conversion and Reversion in Missiological Perspective

At its best, conversion to Christian faith is not only a matter of religious allegiance; it embraces also the whole of culture. The convert moves from one worldview to embrace a new worldview, which may lead to a rejection of the convert's original culture.²⁹ Studies of indigenization in missionary work stress the importance of planting an indigenous church, by which missiologists mean a church that belongs fully to the soil (or culture) in which it is planted. The importance of planting an indigenous church was recognized already in the mid-1800s by Rufus Anderson and Henry Venn, who, working independently, came up with the three-self formulation of the indigenous church: a church is indigenous if it is self-governing, self-supporting, and self-propagating. More recent studies have emphasized the necessity of being also self-

theologizing – that is, constructing a theological understanding of the gospel fully within the terms of the host culture.³⁰

The BIC missionary church was aware of this conversation in missionary circles, but thought primarily in terms of Venn and Anderson's three-self formula.³¹ Thus, although the desire to plant a fully African church existed from the beginning, missionaries taught – and converts heard – that gospel truths came primarily in Western forms. We can refer to this relatively surface indigeneity as adaptation or accommodation, in which some indigenous forms are retained, but foreign forms are often used to convey the deepest truths. The transfer of authority to the Zimbabwean BIC operated with this relatively surface understanding of the indigenous church.

Paul Hiebert analyzes a basic problem that this tendency leads to in his seminal essay, "The Flaw of the Excluded Middle." The Western worldview typical of Western missionaries has two levels, that of high religion (the orthodox Christian faith taught to converts) and technology (the natural methods used in everything from farming to education to medical care). The cultures to which the missionaries went are three-tiered: high religion (the formal system of belief, with religious specialists and often with Scriptures and its own developed philosophy); folk religion (spiritual practices to deal with matters of everyday life, such as birth, death, agriculture, sickness, and so on); and technology.³² One can see the folk religious aspects of Ndebele life in Barbara Nkala's description of African life.³³ She begins with traditional African beliefs, which include a kind of high religion (although less developed than in Christian faith), then describes the beliefs in ancestral spirits, traditional ceremonies, first crops ceremony, and the rain-making ceremony. As she states, "In the traditional African context, nothing simply happened; religious belief explained life. There was always cause and effect, whether it was a good phenomenon or a bad one."³⁴

The missionaries replaced this spiritual cause and effect with a naturalistic understanding of cause and effect, thus excluding the middle zone of folk religion from people's lives. African high religion could move relatively easily into a Christian framework, even using the traditional name for God as the name for the God of the Bible. Further, Ndebele high religion had no written Scriptures and a less-developed formal framework; thus at one level conversion to Christian faith was an easy and natural step for people in Zimbabwe to make.

At a deeper level, however, the call to abandon folk religious practices without offering functional substitutes was unsatisfying. If one understands a particular illness to have a spiritual cause,

then offering natural medicine without any spiritual component is incomplete. In order to meet these deeper spiritual needs, people sometimes concealed traditional practices beneath a surface compliance with the missionaries' culture.³⁵

Hiebert's term, "the flaw of the excluded middle," has been described in other ways also, such as Christopaganism (that is, forms that look Christian, enshrining meanings from the pre-Christian religion of the area) and split-level Christianity (that is, Christian on the surface, but traditional beliefs active beneath the surface).³⁶ In each description the essential problem is that Christian faith is so closely tied to a two-tier Western worldview that the essential spirituality of many people groups around the world is ignored.

In an interview with a former member of the BIC Church a little over 20 years ago, the informant spoke about leaving the BIC for a group that communicated with the ancestors. Mission Christianity had nothing to say about *amadlozi* (the ancestors), so that in the end he found it unsatisfying.³⁷ His case may be a pattern: excluding from mission Christianity the middle zone in which daily life is thoroughly spiritual may lead the convert to revert to some other belief system that takes seriously traditional religious concerns. Another cultural issue is the traditional practice of polygamy, which was proscribed by the missionaries as violating Christian faith. It would be more accurate to say that polygamy is simply non-Western. An example is the story of Sandi Vundla, who left the church after serving as the founding pastor of the BIC Church in Bulawayo. With no children, he took a second wife in order to have children. In the BIC Church understanding, this choice placed him outside the church. We do not analyse this dynamic of polygamous marriages further, but recognise its presence.³⁸

This cultural clash is one possible reason for reversions. Another possible cause is the identification of Christianity with Settler culture and the colonial system, so that collusion between missionaries and the colonial authorities compromised the BIC in Zimbabwe, leading Christians with nationalist sympathies to leave the church in protest. Certainly many men who would otherwise have considered church membership did not do so for this reason.

Church opposition to involvement in politics was only one way this problem showed itself. Much political planning among African nationalists took place in the beer halls, and BIC opposition to beer drinking meant that men could not be present for important political and social conversations.³⁹ On the face of it, political considerations could have led many in the church to leave the Christian faith. At least two factors mitigated the political effect,

however. First, the church was often engaged in the struggle against the White Settler government. The Roman Catholic Church took the lead, but Methodist leaders, among others, were also prominent. Joshua Nkomo, the father of the revolution, was himself a lay minister in the church planted by English Methodists.⁴⁰ Second, the fact that the BIC missionaries withdrew during the war can be read positively and negatively. Negatively, one can ask why they did not stay and suffer with their Zimbabwean brothers and sisters. Not all missionaries from other societies across the country withdrew. The official statement was that the Zimbabwean church requested their withdrawal.⁴¹ Positively, the withdrawal of the missionaries meant the end of any missionary control of the institutions of the church. One notes that autonomy in 1964 had not meant the end of missionary control. However unintentionally, older patterns of relating between missionaries and national Christians persisted through the 1970s. By the end of the Liberation Struggle, the farms and schools and bookstore and hospitals were all securely in the hands of the Zimbabwean church. As a result the church could no longer be seen as a front for Western interests.

To summarize: we have surveyed the coming of the BIC to Zimbabwe. We have noted the possibility that some who have joined the church may leave the church for some other religious expression more in tune with traditional beliefs. Such reversion may take place for cultural, religious, or political reasons. Ongoing research seeks to hear the stories of some who have chosen to leave Christian faith and the BIC in Zimbabwe.

Interlude: A Missionary's Word

Before turning to the stories of some who have left the BIC in Zimbabwe, we consider the thoughts of a long-time BIC missionary in Zimbabwe. Jake and Nancy Shenk travelled from Pennsylvania to Zimbabwe over 50 years ago. Except for a period of time during the transition to majority rule, they have lived in Zimbabwe since then. In an email communication Jake Shenk discussed the issue of reversions from the BIC Church in Zimbabwe. He identifies three critical points: "1. Fear of traditional beliefs. 2. Looking for more benefit for a person's individual and family lives. 3. More emotional expression in worship."⁴²

Shenk notes the way that a men's meeting modelled on the traditional beer drink attracted a growing number of men in the Mtshabezi District in the early 1990s. In the ensuing discussions, the men were able to talk about many of the problems that they had

with traditional beliefs and life in the church. Notably, Shenk writes:

On a number of occasions, when talking to men about following the Lord, they have replied that they are afraid to repent because by so doing they would jeopardise the safety of their family. In this culture, the man is the protector of his family. Their belief is that if they repent and follow the Lord, this would anger the ancestral spirits and they, in turn, would inflict suffering and bad luck on the family.

Concerning personal benefit, Shenk notes, "There are a number of instances where individuals tried to integrate traditional religion and Christianity. One of the most outstanding ones is the Guta raMwari. Soon after independence this group sprang up and became quite popular. One of the main reasons given by a number of people who left the BIC church was that this group prayed for the sick." This emphasis on healing is shared with Zionists in Zimbabwe.⁴³

Concerning a more emotional expression of worship, Shenk states: "A lot of our young people enjoy emotional expression in worship. ... I noticed a young woman who had left BIC some time [ago] and was now worshipping with one of the Pentecostal groups. I asked her why she was worshipping there and her response was, 'It makes me feel good.'" Shenk adds that the prevalence of the prosperity gospel combines with this worship style to attract young people.

In a further email Shenk adds that the political component mentioned above is less important now. The political crises of the past 15 years have taken centre stage, and the colonial past is less of a factor.⁴⁴ This may be true, although one must add that present crises generally have their roots in the history of the people and place. That history, given briefly above, it is still relevant.

Shenk's observations on factors influencing reversion (cultural practices; the search for personal benefit; and more emotional worship) support especially the cultural and religious reason suggested above. When social and political contexts change, established worldview paradigms come under pressure to change as well. In the beginning of the missionary era, that social pressure for change supported conversion to Christian faith. At this point in time, the pressure for change does not appear to lead to large-scale reversions; where it does, those reversions are often conversions to a more African form of the church – whether in one of the New Pentecostal Churches, or in one of the African Initiated Churches (AICs).⁴⁵

From this preliminary theoretical section, we move to the work of Bekitemba Dube to give 13 concrete personal stories.⁴⁶

Reversion Cases

1. Siphumuzile Ndlovu

Ndlvou was born in the Tsholotsho district North West of Bulawayo in 1973. Her family were Zionist. She married the late Leonard Nkomo of Mtshabezi in 1989. They met in Gwanda while she worked as a maid. He was working in a mine near Gwanda. They lived at Mazikhelela near Mtshabezi Mission where she still lives. On marriage she joined her husband's relatives at the nearest Brethren in Christ congregation at Impu. The BIC Church later planted a congregation at Mazikhelela which was closer to their home. She accepted Christ and was baptised at Mtshabezi Mission that year after receiving instruction on the Imibuzo lempendulo BIC Church pre-baptism lessons.⁴⁷

She reverted to Zionism after a visit to her Tsholotsho home. She joined a group called Twelve Apostolic Church, which meets to the northwest of Mtshabezi Mission. She later moved to the United Apostolic Church to which she goes now. Despite the names "Apostolic Church," these two are Zionist-type churches. While she became a member of her United Apostolic church, she said she enjoyed the teachings of the BIC Church, in particular at the Women's meetings. She has even attended BIC General Conference. She commended the teaching aspect of the Brethren in Christ.

One major difference Ndlvou cited between her old and new churches is the prayers for the sick. The Zionist group prophesies on her health and prays for the protection of her grandchildren against evil spirits. She also prayed that her daughter obtain employment during times she was not employed. "When I left BIC I was baptised in Zion. I have kept my BIC baptism Certificate because the future is not known."

2. Martha Mkandla

Mkandla was born, according to her documents, in 1930. She attended school at Impu Primary School. Mandla Mpande was a preacher. He used to teach the children Sunday School. She used to

enjoy the song, “*Nginga hlanzwa ngani na.*” (“What can wash away my sins”). Mpande also taught them on Wednesdays.

Mkandla left school when she was in third class. She took over the duty to care for her siblings, as her mother had died. The end of school for her was also the end of church as school and church were synonymous for her.

In the early 1960s she had a sickly child. Mkandla then started to shop around for the healing of her child. She went through some rites prescribed by a man called Mathimulana, an African doctor (*inyanga*) who was based at Gwandavale. Mathimulana diagnosed the child’s sickness as due to the problem that her breast milk was dirty. The treatment was rubbing concoctions on to the breasts via small cuts from a sharp instrument.

That time also saw her attending services with the Twelve Apostolic church, which came to that area from Masase in the Midlands, about the year 1960. She was baptised into the Twelve Apostolic Church. “They pray over and you and give *imithandazo* in the form of water that you take with you to drink and to mix with your bathing water,” she said. “I am now in ZCC (Zion Christian Church) in Zion and they also give *imithandazo* in the form of water or in the form of JOKO” (a brand of tea that Zionist and apostolic churches believe has healing qualities once prayed for). It is widely used in African Initiated Churches to assist in healing.

The word *umthandazo* is the word used to mean prayer in Sindebele. The AIC use it to mean any item that is given to someone who has a prayer request as an item to strengthen their faith. Some items given are strings of wool to tie up on the limbs or the neck or the waist, though they also use different concoctions. In traditional religion items such as medicated strings are used for protection against sickness and against evil spirits in the same manner. She says the ZCC has officers who are called doctors who specialise in healing.

3. Sikhathele Mpofu, nee Ndlovu

Mpofu was born at Matopo Mission on January 13, 1968. Her Mother died when she was six months old. Father died when she was 10 years old. She remained under the custody of her late father’s brother. Her grandmother had been an inmate of Mtshabezi Girls’ School, Egedini, and as a result the family were BIC.⁴⁸

The father’s brother who looked after her as guardian was a business man. He concentrated on his business and left the church.

Mpofu had a problem of being sickly. Her aunt took her to a Zionist group for healing. Later when her grandmother became sick the Zionists, through her aunt, came to offer prayers at the home. The Zionists took over the religious life of the family. With the death of the old lady, the family became Zionist. The Zionists were in charge of the old woman's funeral. BIC came as neighbours but they were not in charge. This grandmother was one who had attended the famous Mtshabezi mission school of refuge, Egedini.

Upon marriage Mpofu moved to a place near Mtshabezi Mission. Her new family were Zionist so she became part of them. Although this was a different Zionist group she found it easy to be part of them. "The reason I joined [the] Zionist[s] is that that when I was sick as a child they helped me. They gave me holy oil, raspberry mixed with vinegar, eucalyptus [a concoction bought from South Africa believed to be extract of the Gum tree and Joko]. They also used to give me *isiwatsho* for cleansing." Raspberry is a brand of soft drink, an imitation of Raspberry juice. Eucalyptus is a juice believed to be taken from parts of the gum tree. It is bottled and imported from South Africa. This Church is called "The Church of God in Zion, Ekuphileni."

4. Evelyn Ncube

Ncube was born at Matopo Mission in 1966. She was educated up to Form Two at Silobi Secondary School (Silobini to the south east of Matopo Mission). Her family was divided up on religion, with some members going to the Seventh Day Adventist church while the other group worshipped with the Brethren in Christ. She accepted Christ in the BIC Church in 2010 and was baptised by Rev. Norman Dewa in 2011. In 2013 she joined the ZCC in pursuit of healing. She walks some 10 kilometres to Ntunjambili west of Matopo Mission to attend services. Her health problem is high blood pressure. She has been to clinics and hospitals as a result but she did not seem to improve. She still goes to United Bulawayo Hospitals.

At Zion Ncube gets water that has been prayed over and Joko tea. "The Brethren in Christ also pray but they do not give you any item to hold on to," she confessed.

5. Tymon Ndlovu

Ndlovu was born in 1965. He is not sure where he was born but his parents have always lived at Manonkwe near Shake. His parents were not church people. He used to go to Shake Church with his aunt's children. At the age of 18 he was involved in the choir, which he enjoyed. His cousins were in the choir too.

Ndlovu later went to live in Mondoro Ngezi in Shona speaking territory for a while. There was no BIC church there, so he joined the Zion Apostolic Church with headquarters in Masvingo under David Masuka. On returning from Mashonaland, Tymon joined a locally available church called St. Peter's Church of Christ. "When I returned from Mashonaland I joined a local group called St Peter's Church of Christ," he explained. "When I went I had a problem of unemployment and *ukugula* [I was sick]." He continued with an explanation of how this church assisted him:

People come to these churches when they have problems that may be troubling and when they are sick. The church begins with prophesy. In the prophecy they tell you what is the cause of your problem. They drive away evil spirits that may be causing the sickness. They can also tell you who is bewitching you. They can also give you *intethelelo*. *Intethelelo* is something to help you when you pray; *intethelelo* can be water mixed with methylated spirit. Drinking this concoction is meant to induce vomiting or diarrhea, [which] are believed to cause spiritual cleansing. You can be asked to bring *vimbela* (... bought from South Africa), also water mixed with milk. They may also ask you to apply this mixture to your body for healing and for protection against evil spirits and further sickness.

Ndlovu continued with a description of "One major difference I noticed," that "is that the Zionists and apostolic groups [...] use *isiprofethi*." *Isiprofethi* is prophecy: a prophet in the church tells your problem or/and its cause and therapy. They may also tell you what you should do to prevent further occurrences of the problem. "At times the Brethren in Christ pray for people," said Ndlovu, "but they do not tell what the cause is, neither do they prophesy or give you anything to take with you."

6. Elliot Mpofu

Mpofu was born near Mtshabezi in 1940. Mpofu says he was a member of the church as a child because he was a school pupil at Mtshabezi Primary School. During this period he faithfully

attended Sunday School. "Nancy Kreider was the Sunday School teacher," he recalled. "She used to tell us interesting Bible stories that we enjoyed."

"I did not get baptised because I was still young and did not know what to expect in the future." Mpofo continued:

When I grew up after my brothers died I remained as the oldest in the family. We had problems that needed solutions. Children were sick; the older children could not keep jobs. Cattle were dying. Being the oldest it meant the lot fell on me to lead the family. We visited prophets and African doctors. I was given the duty to lead in appeasing the ancestral spirits. So that these problems would come to an end. As such I could not at the same time be attend church. I still see the Brethren in Christ as my church, [but] the two do not mix. I do not go to church but my wife does. We do not involve her in ancestral rites. She even goes away on a visit to allow us to do our things while she is away.

7. M⁴⁹

M is an elder member of the BIC. He has held some senior appointments in the church. M was baptised in 1944 by Rev. Eshleman. His father was a Christian himself. He worked as a teacher in BIC-run schools like Maphane and Dambashoko. M was manager for BIC schools in the 1960s. He became headmaster of Mtshabezi Primary in the period soon after black majority rule. M joined an African Initiated Church (AIC) in the mid-1980s, named "Izenzelo Zenhlanyelo Yokholo." This AIC is commonly known as "Zenzelo." The church was started by a maMambo, who apparently was influenced by the Oral Roberts group with whom she used to correspond. The name "Izenzelo zenhlanyelo yokholo" is the Sindebele translation of *Miracle Seed Faith Of Oral Roberts*. M, however became syncretistic:

My daughter was very sick, she had been to doctors and hospitals, nothing seemed to help. We then heard that there was a church that heals. We visited there in search of healing. My wife and daughter became members. We later moved to a Pentecostal group where she seems to have been finally healed. We could not join this group because I found the Pentecostal way difficult to follow.

Zenzelo includes a service dedicated for ancestor worship, where sacrifices are made to Ancestors (*amadlozi* or *imimoya yeminden*). During this worship service, each family are supposed to talk to their own ancestors and tell them / pray as it were about

the problems they may be facing at the time.” M is now back in the Brethren in Christ.

7. Kevin Moyo

Moyo was born in 1952. He was educated up to Standard Four at Nswazi. Moyo gave himself to the Lord in 1965 at the preaching of a BIC evangelist, Tomas Moyo, at his Munkula Home Church. He was working in Bulawayo as a domestic worker then. He was baptised into a church called The Christian Fellowship Apostolic Church that same year. Two years later he returned to his Munkula home and became an active member of the Brethren in Christ Church.

Moyo became one of the people trained under the Theological Education by Extension (TEE), which was divided into outreach teams. He soon left because, as he put it, other groups were jealous of the successful outreach by his group. He joined a group called Christendom Pentecostal Church. This group, Moyo says, was formed by a gentleman called Niya Mpofo. Moyo says that Mpofo left the Brethren in Christ because it did not allow tongues.

Moyo is a well known itinerate evangelist around Munkula, which is some 15 kilometers from Mtshabezi. He goes as far as Mtshabezi Mission. He is popularly known as MaHebheru. MaHebheru also talks about how he conducts exorcism, which practice is not in the BIC.

8. Beauty Ndlovu

Ndlovu comes from Khozi/Wabayi area some 20 kilometers to the west of Mtshabezi Mission. She went to Wabayi Primary School. Her mother was a member of the Brethren in Christ Church. She then went to live with her mother's first cousin, Mkubo Dube, a well-known staunch member of the Brethren in Christ Church of his time. They went to church every Sunday and held family prayers daily.

Ndlovu was baptised at the age of 13 after making a personal confession of the faith. At marriage she moved to Sizeze with her family. The location of her new family home was rather too far from the nearest BIC church at Sizeze. Being the only Christian, she found it hard to walk the distance to Sizeze. This time she stayed without worship. The family moved on to a place east of Ratanyana. Still she found Ratayana was too far from her home. She ended up joining the nearest church: Congregational Church in

Zion. When the family that led this Zionist church moved on, she joined Asiya Zion, near Ndabankulu. When her husband died she was a member of this Zionist church. Later she moved to Johannesburg. Here she did not look for BIC; instead, she joined the nearest Zionist group. When a member of this group reports being sick, the member is given *Umthandazo*. *Umthandazo* is an item that serves as something you can hold on to prompt your faith when praying. This includes items like:

- A) Sea water: this comes in bottles sold in shops in South Africa (some petty traders even bring it to Zimbabwe to sell to Zionists).
- B) Wool of different colours that are used as armbands or tied above the ankles, or around the waist.
- C) *Isiwatsho* (coarse salt that has been prayed over), which is spread around your home/house to protect you from evil spirits, wizards (*abathakathi*) and goblins (*tikolotshi*).
- D) *Itswayi labo tikolotshi* (salt against *tikolotshis*). *Tikolotshi* is believed to be a spirit being that is kept by people for riches. It is particularly believed to be kept by business men who are associates with South Africans.

Ndlovu's primary reason for continuing as a Zionist is ill health and that her children have been finding it hard to get stable jobs. It is interesting to note that while she claims that distance was the cause of her failure to continue with BIC, she has since become staunch Zionist. Yet Ndabankulu, where she worships, is within a kilometre of Maribeha, where there is a Brethren in Christ congregation. In fact, she must walk a much longer distance to get to her independent church. One practice she has seen and participated in is to have prophets tell her about misfortunes she is about to go through and what to do in order to avoid them.

9. Nephath Mlangeni

Mlangeni was born at Mtshabezi's old hospital in 1940. He received his education at Mtshabezi. He completed his education in 1958, the same year he was baptised a member of the Brethren in Christ. He went through Sunday School teachings as a child. "I grew up under the laws of the Brethren in Christ," he explained:

Baptism meant accepting to be a Christian. The teaching emphasised the Bible and its ways. I continued to worship at Mpopoma when I was working in Bulawayo. In the year 1990 I took to drinking and became irregular in church. In 1995 a friend led me to the Zion Christian Church because I had a pain in my feet that refused to heal. However in

1998 I went back to BIC Mpopoma after I got healed. However I returned to ZCC in the year 2000.

Mlangeni has risen in the ranks of the ZCC to be a minister and the Church Secretary. He was anointed a minister in South Africa at Moriya. The local headquarters are in Bulawayo.

10. Sibusisiwe Zhou

Zhou was born on March 6, 1970 and grew up in Gwanda. She went to school up to grade seven in Gwanda, then went to her rural home for her Secondary Education. She then trained in a Diploma in Education at Joshua Mqabuko Nkomo Polytechnic (formerly Gwanda Zintec College). She then went on to do a Bachelor of Education in Special Education. She now holds a Master's degree in Special Education, and lectures in Special Education at Joshua Mqabuko Nkomo Polytechnic. A married woman, she is mother of three.

Her father was a member of the BIC Church. When he came back from detention he was no longer in good health. He then sought for assistance in healing from the Apostolic Faith church, which he joined. This was a Zionist type church. "He took us with him to his new church," Zhou explained, "although we were members of the Brethren in Christ Church." Zhou, however, was baptised in the BIC Church at the age of 13. She actively participated in church activities and became a lead singer in the Praise and Worship team at BIC Gwanda (Jahunda Congregation).

On marriage she took up her husband's church, Zviratidzo ZveVapostori Church (ZZC, Signs of the Apostles). This is an apostolic type church, of which she is still a member. Zhou says many who join her new church do so on account of seeking healing. These people, she said, do not trust or believe that God hears them when they pray, hence they come to seek the assistance of prophet healers. They do not even seek God, or seek to know him, after they are prayed for. Some people from the mainline churches, even from the BIC, visit ZCC when they have problems, particularly when sick. This is all the more true if they have problems with chronic illnesses. Healers are called doctors in her church. Part of her house in Gwanda has a room called a "hospital," and her husband is a high ranking official of ZCC. Sibusisiwe occasionally visits BIC.⁵⁰

11. Janet Tshuma

Tshuma was born in 1938. She was educated at Mtshabezi and Sitezi after 1950, and baptised at Gwandavale in the early 1960s, another BIC school. The students were taught scriptures to follow in their lives, and they were also taught *umthetho*. She got married into a prominent BIC family that lives near Mtshabezi (the Mayisa family).

When she got older she became sick. As a result she visited many places in search of healing. At the hospital medical personnel indicated that she should have an operation performed on her. She went as far as having a scan done. "My brother refused and said no one has ever had an operation done on her/him in the family."

Her children took her to many healers, even as far as Mashonaland where some of her children live. Her husband heard about a prophet, Ngwenya, who would be visiting Sibona area within five kilometers from her home, and recommended that she go there for healing. "Ngwenya prophesied that I will be lame by the time I die," she reported. "My late father himself was lame from childhood." She is now a member of Ngwenya's church called the Chosen Apostolic Church.

The healing process prescribed to her involves the use of water. Three or four, and sometimes five, stones are placed in the healing water. She is made to drink some of the water and mix some with her bathing water for three days in the process. "The Brethren in Christ Church did not do any bad thing for me," she said, adding "it is a good church but I am not going back because I want healing."

12. Zaccheus Nkomo

Nkomo was born in 1941. His father was a practicing traditional worshipper (*Waye gida*), and practiced the rites of ancestor worship. He later became a member of the BIC Church.

Nkomo was born in the Matshetshe area at Silikwe, which is predominantly BIC. He went to primary school at Zhukwe, then to Lumene and to Matopo Mission where he did his Standard Six in 1960. In 1961 he worked at Matopo to pay for his school fees. After Matopo he went to train in Agriculture at Gloak Range in Matabeleland North. There was no BIC Church there, so he went into womenizing and drinking and other vices. His wife came from Lupane. She had been at Matopo as well. However, they stopped worshipping.

Nkomo has since returned both to Christianity and to the BIC Church. He was baptised at Ntunte in 2013. He says the love of Christ overwhelmed him when he “turned back to the Lord.” Even when he was out of the church, Nkomo says that for him, the church was always the BIC.

13. A and B

A and B are both female High School pupils at a secondary school, and are both 16 years old. They attended Sunday School at Mazikhelela. They were then invited to the Zion Christian Church about four kilometres from their home. The BIC congregation meets about a kilometre from their home. When they got to the ZCC, they went through a purification process (*ukuhlanjululwa*). Members go through an annual baptism ceremony for the purpose of personal cleansing. Smaller purification rituals also take place before every service. When women have their monthly period they are considered unclean, and should not come to church. On their return they undergo a purification ritual. The women who have given birth are also considered unclean and do not attend Church until they are purified.

These girls said they enjoy the dancing. Some of the purification they say involves passing through the human gate of prophets, who prophesy what sins you have committed. Sometimes you are made to make your own confession. Then you are given a prescription of what type of cleansing you have to go through. The girls said they did not like when some of the concoctions are introduced to the alimentary canal to induce diarrhoea.

Causes for Reversion in these Cases

These case studies indicate a number of different causes for the reversion of a BIC member to one’s former religious affiliation. In Case 1 it would seem that upbringing in the AIC can cause a person who later accepts BIC worship to revert back to the AIC. Case 1 is complicated, however, by the fact that the community accused Ndlovu of an immoral relationship with one of the leaders of an AIC. In Cases 5, 6, and 13, the cause is the problem of ill health. It is believed that failure to afford medical care, and the declining health care of the formal system, leaves many vulnerable to AICs. Case 8 is a power struggle, where someone felt they were doing better than others and thus deserved better recognition.

African traditional religions are usually taken to be an answer to problems in the family, particularly the extended family. It is interesting to note that the type of problems are the same as for individuals that go to an AIC. Some people leave the church because of a vice they are involved in. Immorality and alcohol may be the pull. In some cases, individuals go straight to the vice. In other cases, they may hide behind some independent church. Marrying more than one wife is justified through the example of Old Testament characters. Some of the marriages are simple unions to which the AIC tends to ignore. Sometimes the purification at the beginning of the service is meant to take care of the immoral acts that may have been committed since the last time they attended a church service.

Some people leave the BIC because they have not been strong members in the first place – people for whom worship is merely carrying a Bible, without being taught biblical truth. It can also be suggested that the African Initiated Churches do not have a demand for strong financial commitment, as is so prevalent in the BIC. It would be interesting to follow up with churches like the Christendom Pentecostal Church, which is said to have been formed as a result of a breakaway from the BIC at the advent of Charismatic Pentecostalism.

Conclusions

As Dube's analysis suggests, the original theoretical factors for reversion tend to be supported by the stories people tell. In general, spiritual and social factors are more important than political factors. In case 10 there is a reference to a person kept in detention – a political note, and in case 11 resistance to a (Western medical) surgery – which has overtones of resisting Western influence. But in general the overwhelming reasons are spiritual and social: taking care of oneself and one's family physically and socially through spiritual means.

Earlier, we drew on Hiebert's description of "the flaw of the excluded middle" to note three tiers in the cultures to which the missionaries went: high religion; folk religion; and technology. In the collected experiences, the informants referred to a desire to remain in contact with the BIC Church. This desire reflects the congruence of their lives with Christianity as a high religion. But when physical and social concerns – concerns from the "excluded middle," especially the desire for healing – become important, they looked for forms of faith that deal with these concerns. Most often

these forms of faith were found in Zionist and Apostolic churches, or in syncretistic cults such as Zenzelo, which take the world or the spirits seriously and seek to bring healing from that world into the middle zone of daily life.

This observation fits well with research into the forms that AICs have taken in Zimbabwe and South Africa.⁵¹ A question that goes beyond the scope of this essay is whether or not these AICs are genuinely Christian, or fall outside the bounds of Christian faith. As a general principle, one can note that they may indeed be good forms of contextualized faith in the southern African context. The concern for good biblical training noted in the work of Fambidzano (the Bible training program described in Daneel's work in endnote 47) suggests that AICs move on a spectrum from syncretistic to genuinely indigenous Christianity. It is the task of the church in Zimbabwe, rather than of the missionaries (or former missionaries), to speak to these issues more definitively. For our purposes we note that the attraction for AICs found in the informants' stories reflects an application of the principles described in Hiebert's "flaw of the excluded middle."

A further word about Zionism and Apostolic Churches: Zionism is a form of AIC that is sometimes called a dancing church, in which the members dance in a circle while singing and praying. Extensive use is made of healing prayers and of prayer to cast out spirits that are troubling the person. Apostolic Churches are similar, but more formalized. I (Climenhaga) attended a Zionist Church for the year of 1990, as well as a congregation of the Apostles of Johane Marange periodically throughout the same year. Both groups impressed me as having brought the concerns of African culture thoroughly to bear on their lives as Christians. Dube has more understanding of this area of church life in Zimbabwe. Indeed, it is the task of the Zimbabwean church (not of North American Christians) to determine if the efforts of the Zionists and Apostolic Churches are primarily syncretistic or a good contextualization of the gospel.

Dube's suggestion of further research on the AIC offshoot of the BIC is interesting and worth pursuing. Hearing the stories of more people can also reveal if there are generational differences at work. Dube's informants provide a good cross-section of ages and education. One can begin analysing them for differences based on these and other factors. Additional stories will strengthen the analysis.

Notes

- 1 The authors are Bekitemba Dube of the BIC Church in Zimbabwe and Daryl Climenhaga of the BIC in Canada. Dube is a third-generation Christian in the BIC and has worked with the church for much of his life. He now works as the BIC HIV/AIDS Program Coordinator in Zimbabwe. As a third-generation missionary in Zimbabwe Climenhaga was a pastor and teacher in the BIC in Zimbabwe and now teaches Global Studies at Providence Theological Seminary in Manitoba, Canada. Climenhaga and Dube worked together in the BIC in Zimbabwe from 1988 to 1990, and Dube has researched the life of the in Zimbabwe extensively as one of the authors in the Global Mennonite History Project. In a personal note affixed here, Climenhaga expresses his appreciation to Bekitemba Dube for his work in collecting these people's stories. Climenhaga writes that Dube "has made a valuable contribution to our understanding of the phenomena of conversions and reversions within the church in Zimbabwe. Without his work, this would have been a theoretical essay of only theoretical interest. He has helped me greatly to understand better the practical impact and implications of the material I have studied for so long. Thank you, umfo wethu."
- 2 See Carlton Wittlinger, *Quest for Piety and Obedience* (Nappanee, IN: 1978) for the definitive history of the BIC CHURCH in North America. Wittlinger gives the roots of the missionary movement in chapter nine, including the beginnings of the work in Zimbabwe (178-185). For a good older history of the missionary movement, see Stephen Neill, *A History of Christian Missions* (Harmondsworth, U.K.: Penguin Books, 1956). For a more recent history written from a missiological perspective, see Paul E. Pierson, *The Dynamics of Christian Mission: History Through a Missiological Perspective* (Pasadena, CA: William Carey International University, 2009).
- 3 See Alemu Checole et al., *Anabaptist Songs in African Hearts* (Intercourse, PA: Good Books, 2006). In chapter two, "The Africa Context," Barbara Nkala gives an excellent overview of the situation into which the first missionaries came. In chapter four, "Brethren in Christ Churches in Southern Africa," Bekithemba Dube, Doris Dube, and Barbara Nkala cover the coming of the BIC CHURCH to Zimbabwe. See also Neil Parsons, *A New History of Southern Africa* (Harare: The College Press, 1990).
- 4 Zimbabwe has gone by a variety of names following its founding as Rhodesia under the British South African Company. We refer to the country as Zimbabwe throughout this paper.
- 5 In the records "Matopo" (whether referring to the mission or the hills) is spelled variously "Matoppo," "Matopa," "Matobo," and so on. We follow the source material in quotes, but otherwise use the present spelling, "Matopo."
- 6 See Eliakim M. Sibanda, *The Zimbabwe African People's Union 1961-87: A Political History of Insurgency in Southern Rhodesia* (Trenton: Africa World Press, 2005) and Neil Parsons, *Focus on History: A Lower Secondary Course for Zimbabwe, Book Two* (Harare, Zimbabwe: The College Press, 1985) for a history of the indigenous Zimbabweans' struggles to regain control of their country.
- 7 "Our Times," *Evangelical Visitor* June 1, 1898 (XI:11), 219. *Evangelical Visitor* hereafter abbreviated as *EV*.
- 8 I assume West Africa, based on where the United Brethren were working. For a description of what is probably this massacre in Sierra Leone, see Edward H. Berman, ed., *African Reactions to Missionary Education* (NY:

- Teachers College Press, 1975), 92. I am indebted to Alison Fitchett Climenhaga for this reference.
- ⁹ Jesse Engle, "In Africa," *EV* Feb. 15, 1898 (XI:4), 77-78.
- ¹⁰ Jesse Engle, "From Africa," *EV* Aug. 15, 1898 (XI:16), 319.
- ¹¹ Jesse Engle, "Matopa Mission," *EV* Nov. 1, 1898 (XI:21), 418-419.
- ¹² For a description of this process, see the essays in Robin Palmer and Neil Parsons, eds., *The Roots of Rural Poverty in Central and Southern Africa* (Berkeley, University of California Press, 1977).
- ¹³ See Terence O. Ranger, *Voices from the Rocks* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1999).
- ¹⁴ In Checole et al., 99.
- ¹⁵ Jesse Engle, "Matopa Mission," *EV* Sept. 15, 1898 (XXI:18), 358.
- ¹⁶ H. Frances Davidson, "The Land Question," *EV* Mar. 16, 1903 (XVII:6), 14.
- ¹⁷ Church Growth literature in missiology refers to this approach of establishing mission stations as a particular kind of reliance on institutions (See Donald McGavran, *Understanding Church Growth* [Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1990. First published 1970].) The BIC missionary understanding of mission stations can be gauged from the way that the history of BICWM, written for the 50th anniversary in 1948, refers to the first three as the "central stations." Anna R. Engle, J.A. Climenhaga, and Leoda A. Buckwalter, *There is No Difference* (Nappanee, IN: E.V. Publishing House, 1950), 24.
- ¹⁸ The *Handbook of Mission, Brethren in Christ Church* (Printed in the USA) notes previous medical work, but the building was completed and the first doctor was assigned in 1951. *Handbook*, 92.
- ¹⁹ *Handbook* 1965, 20.
- ²⁰ Nancy Heisey, "Of Two Minds: Ambivalence in the Language of Brethren in Christ Missionaries. Part I: Africa," *Brethren in Christ History and Life* XI, no. 1 (1988): 10-43.
- ²¹ See Dwight Thomas, "A Biographical Sketch of David (Ndhlalambi) Moyo: Early African Mission Worker in the Brethren in Christ Church in Zambia," *Brethren in Christ History and Life* XXXIII, no. 3 (2010): 594-656.
- ²² One must not overstate the case here. Davidson expressed in her own writings a real appreciation for the Africans she worked with, but she also used the common language of the day that referred to African adult men as "boys."
- ²³ See Wittlinger, 342-362, for a description of the way that the doctrine of separation functioned within the early BIC CHURCH.
- ²⁴ *Handbook* 1965, 7.
- ²⁵ See Eliakim Sibanda for the story of Ndebele side of this conflict.
- ²⁶ See the missionaries listed in the quarterly missionary pages in the *Evangelical Visitor*—generally the first issue of the quarter (January, April, July, and September in 1978).
- ²⁷ The *EV* reported the withdrawal of the final group of missionaries in the October 10, 1979 issue, p. 14.
- ²⁸ The first section of this essay is written from the missionary perspective. For a telling of the first contact with missionaries from a Zimbabwean perspective, see I.N. Mpofu, "Strange Religion Comes to the Ndebele," *Brethren in Christ History and Life* XXI, no. 3 (1998): 361-397, as well as Checole et al, *Anabaptist Songs in African Hearts*. For a comparison of missionary and indigenous perspectives, see Daryl Climenhaga, "Through

- African Eyes: Reflections on Anniversary Plays,” *Brethren in Christ History and Life* XXI, no. 3 (1998): 343-360).
- ²⁹ See David Burnett, *Clash of Worlds* (Carlisle, UK: Monarch Books, 1990) for a discussion of the relationship between worldview and religious faith.
- ³⁰ The literature in this area is varied and extensive. See, for example, Darrell L. Whiteman, “Contextualization: The Theory, the Gap, the Challenge,” *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* 21, no. 1 (1997): 2-7. A. Scott Moreau has recently produced a definitive study, *Contextualization in World Missions: Mapping and Assessing Evangelical Models* (Grand Rapids, MI: Kregel, 2012). I learned the addition of self-theologizing to the three selfs from Whiteman in my own missiological training.
- ³¹ See Arthur Climenhaga’s reports as the General Superintendent of the mission work in Zimbabwe and Zambia in the *Handbook for World Missions* throughout the 1950s.
- ³² Paul Hiebert, “The Flaw of the Excluded Middle,” *Anthropological Insights for Missiological Issues*, Paul Hiebert (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 1994), 189-201.
- ³³ In Checole et al., 24-28.
- ³⁴ *Ibid.*, 27.
- ³⁵ This whole area repays further study in terms of the differing perspectives on events of the local people and of the missionaries. For example, Jesse Engle, the founding father, died in 1900, less than two years after coming to Matopo. Missionary documents interpret his sacrifice of self in the cause of the gospel. Unrecorded are the interpretations of the people around the missionaries, who would normally have seen such a death as evidence of a spiritual power that worked against the missionaries. They might naturally have concluded that one of the other missionaries was jealous of Engle and placed a curse on him. The response of the missionaries to Engle’s death would likely have caused confusion in the minds of the local people.
- ³⁶ See, for example, Alan R. Tippett, “Christopaganism or Indigenous Christianity,” in *Readings in Missionary Anthropology II*, ed. William A. Smalley (Pasadena, CA: William Carey, 1978), 400-421.
- ³⁷ Anonymous interview conducted by Daryl Climenhaga, n.d.
- ³⁸ See Wendy Urban-Mead’s account of BIC CHURCH Christians, *The Gender of Piety: Intersections of Faith and Family in Matabeleland Zimbabwe Since 1900* (Athens, OH: Ohio University Press, forthcoming).
- ³⁹ See Harry F. Wolcott, *The African Beer Gardens of Bulawayo: Integrated Drinking in a Segregated Society* (Rutgers, NJ: Rutgers Center of Alcohol Studies, 1974) for a consideration of the way that the beer gardens functioned. Wolcott also interviewed both BIC CHURCH members and missionaries as part of his research.
- ⁴⁰ Eliakim Sibanda. See also R.H. Randolph (SJ), *Dawn in Zimbabwe: The Catholic Church in the New Order. A Report on the Activities of the Catholic Church in Zimbabwe for the Five Years 1977-1981* (Gweru, Zimbabwe: Mambo Press, 1985).
- ⁴¹ I base this statement on my personal memory: I left Zimbabwe in December 1975 and remained in contact with the missionary family. A search of the *EV* and of the *BICWM Handbook* did not unearth an explanation of the final withdrawal of the missionaries.
- ⁴² Personal Email from Jake Shenk, 12 Sept. 2014.

- ⁴³ See the writings of Inus Daneel in this area, for example, *Quest for Belonging* (Gweru, Zimbabwe: Mambo Press, 1988). The “Zionists” refers to members of Zion Christian Church (ZCC) and similar “spirit-filled” or “dancing” churches. I (Climenhaga) worshipped with one such group in Bulawayo from January to December 1990.
- ⁴⁴ Personal Email, 16 Sept. 2014.
- ⁴⁵ See, for example, Daryl Climenhaga, “Pentecostals and the Brethren in Christ in Bulawayo,” *Mission Focus* 13 (2005): 31-41, and “The Spirit and the Church: The Brethren in Christ and Pentecostalism in Zimbabwe,” *Brethren in Christ History and Life* XXII, no. 2 (1999): 273-290.
- ⁴⁶ Dube obtained and received consent from each of the interviewees to use their names and stories. Where a first name only or a letter is used, the informant preferred to remain anonymous or was made anonymous by virtue of age.
- ⁴⁷ The language is isiNdebele – shortened to Sindebele or Ndebele. The people are amaNdebele. In this essay Dube uses the term Sindebele; Climenhaga uses the term Ndebele for the language and for the people. We have placed most Sindebele words in italics, and left place names (Sindebele or English) in regular font.
- ⁴⁸ Egedini – “At the gate” – is a name used for Mtshabezi Mission Girls School. See Wendy Urban-Mead, “Girls of the Gate: Questions of Purity and Piety at the Mtshabezi Girls’ Primary Boarding School in Colonial Zimbabwe,” *Le Fait Missionnaire* 11 (Sept. 2001): 75-99.
- ⁴⁹ Name withheld upon request.
- ⁵⁰ Apostolic and Zionist are two major branches of AICs. Inus Daneel has worked closely with both. See his study of biblical training AICs in Zimbabwe, *Fambidzano: Ecumenical Movement of Zimbabwean Independent Churches* (Gweru, Zimbabwe: Mambo Press, 1989). See also two other books by Daneel, *Old and New in Southern Shona Independent Churches, Volume III* (Gweru, Zimbabwe: Mambo Press, 1988) and *Quest for Belonging* (Gweru, Zimbabwe: Mambo Press, 1988).
- ⁵¹ See especially the works already cited by Inus Daneel (sometimes listed as M.L. Daneel). There is extensive further literature on AICs, but Daneel’s work focusses especially on Zimbabwe.